North Yorkshire County Council

Business and Environmental Services

Transport, Economy and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee

14 October 2015

Ringway Performance - 2014/15

Report of the Corporate Director – Business & Environmental Services

1.0 Purpose of Report

1.1 The purpose of this report is to advise Members of Ringway's performance under the Highways Maintenance Contract (HMC) 2012 during the period 1 April 2014 – 31 March 2015 and of the outcome of the Evaluation Panel held on 29 June 2015.

2.0 Background

- 2.1 Following a lengthy and robust procurement exercise, HMC 2012 was awarded to Ringway (RIS) and the contract commenced on 1 April 2012.
- 2.2 As part of the Contract, an Evaluation Panel is held annually in May to determine the Term of the Contract, which is informed by the Contract Performance Indicators (CPIs). The CPIs comprise Primary Performance indicators (PPIs) and Secondary Performance Indicators (SPIs). It is the PPIs which directly affect the Term of the Contract, although the SPIs can also be taken into consideration. The Evaluation Panel is also used to set the rolling 3rd year CPI targets, together with any interim amendments.
- 2.3 The maximum term of the Contract is 10 years; the minimum term is 6 years. The contract has a 'Claw Back' and a 'Win Back' mechanism, whereby any years clawed back for poor performance can subsequently be won back for good performance.
- 2.4 The Contract Period was reduced to 9 years as part of the decision taken at the HMC 2012 Evaluation Panel on 22 May 2014.

Evaluation Panel – 29 June 2015

- 2.5 The 2015 Evaluation Panel considered the performance of RIS for the period 1 April 2014-31 March 2015. The performance for this period was that 19 out of 23 Primary Performance Indicators (PPIs) and 11 out of 19 Secondary Performance Indicators (SPIs) were met. This compares with the same period in 2013/14 where 10 out of 23 Primary Performance Indicators and 8 out of 19 Secondary Performance Indicators were met.
- 2.6 Based on the improved performance, the Panel took the decision to retain the Term of the contract as 9 years, until 31 March 2021. This decision was subject to the following:
 - The Corporate Director in consultation with the BES Executive Members agrees that by 30 September 2015:

- a. Negotiations with Ringway about the revisions to the new Performance Management Framework have been concluded.
- b. The systems development phase for the new working arrangements for minor works has been completed.
- c. There is a satisfactory conclusion to the discussions with Ringway relating to the Value for Money Review in respect of urban grass cutting.
- 2.7 At the time of writing, the criteria outlined in b. above has been met. It is anticipated the negotiations and discussions associated with a. & c. above will have reached a satisfactory conclusion by the 30 September 2015.

Challenge/Scrutiny

- 2.8 Through the HMC 2012 Governance arrangements, Ringway's performance is scrutinised throughout the year at the monthly Operational Management Group (OMG), quarterly Strategic Management Group (SMG) and 6 monthly Partnering Steering Group (PSG) meetings.
- 2.9 Since the first HMC 2012 Evaluation Panel, Ringway's performance has been further scrutinised by Members at:
 - Transport, Economy and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee (TEE OSC) 17 July 2013
 - BES Executive Members (with County Councillor David Jeffels in attendance as Chairman of TEE OSC) – 27 November 2013
 - TEE OSC 22 January 2014
 - TEE OSC 16 July 2014
 - TEE OSC 21 January 2015

3.0 Consideration

- 3.1 The performance of RIS has improved since the last report. Appendix A details the overall performance for the financial year 2014/15 compared to the previous year. This improvement was recognised by the Evaluation Panel when they reached their decision on 29 June 2015.
- 3.2 As noted in the previous report, a review of the CPIs was undertaken. This review recommended a revised Performance Management Framework is adopted by the Partnership. Agreement in principle has been reached and the revised Framework is currently being worked to by both parties and is included in Appendix B.
- 3.3 As reported to the Committee in January 2015, a joint 'LEAN Review' was undertaken of Basic Maintenance as part of the 2020 North Yorkshire programme. Following the Review, changes to the way in which minor works are ordered and delivered are to be trialled by the Partnership. This trial is due to formally commence on 1 November 2015. The related performance will be formally managed and monitored via the new PPIs: OB7, OB30 & OB90 from 1 April 2016.

4.0 Legal Implications

- 4.1 The requirement for an Annual Review of HMC 2012 is stipulated in the contract documents and shall be completed before 1 June in each Contract Year.
- 4.2 The 2015 Annual Review took place later than stated in 4.1. The Review was delayed as the County Council was in the process of appointing a new Executive. The decision to delay the process was formally notified to and duly accepted by Ringway.

4.3 The Key Decisions associated with the Evaluation Panels in 2013, 2014 and 2015 have been published on the County Council's Statutory Forward Plan in accordance with its Constitution.

5.0 Equalities Impact Assessment

- 5.1 Consideration has been given to the relevance of equality and diversity issues in each of the Evaluation Panels. It was the view of officers that the recommendations had no impact on any of the protected characteristics identified in the Equalities Act 2010.
- 5.2 It is noteworthy; however, that an EIA for HMC 2012 has been jointly developed with Ringway during the mobilisation process and that this was reviewed at the end of May 2014 and will be reviewed again in May 2016.

6.0 Finance Implications

- 6.1 For the period 1 April 2012 to 31 March 2015, approximately £130million of works have been delivered.
- 6.2 Under the revised Performance Management Framework there is the following specific CPI directly relating to finance:
 - SPI S06 Value of Gain Achieved

7.0 Recommendation

- 7.1 It is recommended that Members:
 - i) note the contents of this report and attached appendices

DAVID BOWE

Corporate Director Business & Environmental Services

Author of Report: Andrew Binner

Background Documents: None

Appendix A

Primary Performance Indicators (PPIs)							
Reference No.	PPI	2014/15 Performance	2013/14 Performance				
PPI WM01	Client Satisfaction –Winter Maintenance Gritting Routes	Pass	Pass				
PPI S01	Start on Time	Pass	Pass				
PPI S02	Finish on Time	Pass	Pass				
PPI S03	Defects – Impact at Handover	Pass	Fail				
PPI S04	Streetworks Noticing	Fail	Fail				
PPI S05	Schemes in Gain	Pass	Not Scored				
PPI S06	Value of Gain Achieved	Pass	Not Scored				
PPI RM01	Achievement of Programme – Grass Cutting Urban	Pass	Fail				
PPI RM02	Achievement of Programme – Grass Cutting Rural	Pass	Fail				
PPI RM03	Achievement of Programme –Weed Spraying	Pass	Pass				
PPI RM04	Achievement of Programme – Gully Emptying	Pass	Fail				
PPI RM05	Road Markings	Pass	Fail				
PPI RM06	Achievement of Programme – Surface Dressing	Pass	Pass				

	Secondary Performance Indicators (SPIs)						
Reference No.	SPI	2014/15 Performance	2013/14 Performance				
SPI PCS01	Public Satisfaction – Schemes (excl street lighting)	Fail	Pass				
SPI PCS02	Public Satisfaction – Street Lighting Schemes	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS03	Public Compliments – All Services	Pass	Fail				
SPI PCS04	Public Complaints – All Services	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS05	Annual Client Survey	Fail	Fail				
SPI PCS06	Client Satisfaction – GMU	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS07	Client Satisfaction – Gully Emptying	Pass	Fail				
SPI PCS08	Client Satisfaction – Road Marking	Fail	Fail				
SPI PCS09	Client Satisfaction – Winter Maintenance	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS10	Client Satisfaction – Grass Cutting Urban	Fail	Fail				
SPI PCS11	Client Satisfaction – Grass Cutting Rural	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS12	Client Satisfaction – Fleet	Pass	Pass				
SPI PCS13	Client Satisfaction – Schemes [incl. street lighting if in final contract]	Fail	Pass				

PPI RM07	Defects	Pass	Pass			
PPI RM08	Highway Dangerous Defects CAT 1	Fail	Fail			
PPI RM09	Completion on Time – Emergency Call Outs	Fail	Fail			
PPI RM10	Productivity of GMUs	Pass	Fail			
PPI HS01	Accident Frequency Rate	Pass	Fail			
PPI FM01	Compliance with Servicing Schedule	Pass	Pass			
PPI FM02	MOT Pass Rate	Pass	Pass			
PPI SL01	Street Lighting Fault Repair	Pass	Pass			
PPI SL02	Achievement of Programme – Street Lighting Cyclical Maintenance	Fail	Pass			
PPI VFM01	Benchmarking of material supply prices to ensure VfM	Pass	Pass			

SPI PCS14	Client Satisfaction – Street Lighting Maintenance	Fail	Fail	
SPI AAP01	Contractor Progress against Annual Action Plan – self evaluation	Fail	Fail	
SPI S01	6:4:2 Compliance (Contractor only)	Fail	Fail	
SPI HS01	Number of Service Strikes	Pass	Fail	
SPI HS02	RIDDOR	Pass	Fail	
SPI SUS 01 - A	Monitoring of carbon intensity (Energy, waste and material consumed)	Pass	Fail	
SPI SUS 01 - B	Monitoring of carbon intensity (Energy only)	Pass	Pass	

Appendix B

Primary Performance Indicators (PPIs)				
Reference No.	PPI	Target		
PPI WM01	Winter Maintenance	Various		
PPI S01	Start on Time	90%		
PPI S02	Finish on Time	85%		
	Number of completed works orders that require TMA notices	85%		
PPI S04	Number of compliant notices	85%		
	Number of notices that over run the proposed notice end date	10%		
PPI RM05	Road Markings	80%		
PPI RM06	Achievement of Programme - Surface Dressing	97.00%		
PPI RM08	Highway Dangerous Defects CAT 1 (E24)	99.00%		
PPI RM09	Completion on Time – Emergency Call Outs (E1)	99.00%		
PPI OB7	Basic Maintenance Works Completed witin time (all Work types) 7 Day response	80%*		

Secondary Performance Indicators (SPIs)				
Reference No.	SPI	Target		
SPI S03	Defects - Impact at Handover	85%		
SPI S06	Value of Gain Achieved	Overall schemes to show net 'gain'		
SPI RM01	Achievement of Programme - Grass Cutting Urban	96%		
SPI RM02	Achievement of Programme - Grass Cutting Rural	96%		
SPI RM03	Achievement of Programme - Weed Spraying	96%		
SPI RM04	Achievement of Programme – Gully Emptying			
SPI RM07	Defects	183		
SPI HS01	LTIFR (Lost Time Through Injury Frequency Rate)	2.50		
SPI PCS01	Public Satisfaction – All Schemes	93%		
SPI PCS05	Annual Client Survey A	70%		
SPI PCS05	Annual Client Survey B	70%		

PPI OB30	Basic Maintenance Works Completed witin time (all Work types) 30 Day response	85%*
PPI OB90	Basic Maintenance Works Completed witin time (all Work types) 3 Month response	90%*
PPI FM01	Compliance with Servicing Schedule	88%
PPI FM02	MOT Pass Rate	97%
PPI SL01	Street Lighting Fault Repair	96%
PPI SL02	Achievement of Programme - Street Lighting Cyclical Maintenance	7

SPI AAP01	Contractor Progress against Annual Action Plan – self evaluation	90%
--------------	---	-----

^{*} Targets for 2015/16 are indicative. Associated performance data is for management information purposes only.



Note: When you have completed this section please send copy to originator.

Section 6 CONFIRM ACTION HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED (Supply supporting evidence)

6. Review of RM08 Target as part of Contract Performance Review completed. Using the new target, the performance indicator is currently exceeding the target

Action closed by:	Date:



Issue: 5A

Date: August 2011

Page 2 of 2

Business Ref: RIS HMC Division and/or Location: North Yorkshire Action Report No: 15/16 PPI 2012

Date Pr	Date Prepared: 11 June 2015 Responsibility of: P Jepps											
Improv	vement/Concern		Р	ers	ons	s In	vol	ve	d			
Task	d Completion Date:	P Jepps	M Clayton	R Whitaker	Hub Schedulers	Mike Roberts (NYCC)	Andrew Binner (NYCC)	Contract Managers	Anante		By When	Complete
No	Task Description	۵	Σ	R	Ι	2	∢	C	٥	4	<u>m</u>	S
1	Ensure 24hr defect works orders are compliant with defect definition					X	I				End of June * to be discussed with NYCC	
2	Ensure works are prioritised to ensure compliance			X	I						Immediately	
3	Ensure resources and productivity of resources are sufficient to address 24hr works orders		_					X	I		Immediately	
4	Review RIS process to ensure compliance can be achieved		Χ		I			I	-		End of June 2015	
5	Cancel non-compliant works orders			I	X						Immediately * To be discussed with NYCC	
6	Target of 100% reduced as part of 2015/15 Performance Framework review	I					X				April 2015	Υ
Note ONLY ONE PERSON CAN BE RESPONSIBLE FOR AN ACTIVITY (X = RESPONSIBLE, I = INVOLVED)												

Distribute to:



Issue: 5A Date: August 2011

Page 1 of 2

_						
2	^	^	4i	^	n	- 4

Business Ref: RIS HMC2012 Division and/or North Yorkshire Action Report No: RAP 15/16 PPI Location: RM09 Q2Rev

Section 2

Issued by: P Jepps	Issued to: North Yorkshire	Date: Sept 2015
Contract Number: MU 5382	Works Order Number: N/A	Delivery Note Number: N/A

Section 3 DESCRIPTION OF ISSUE

Not achieving the minimum target of CPI PPI RM09 during the contract year 2014/15 Measure – Completion On Time – Emergency Call Outs - % On time Target 100% - Actual 99.32%

Section 4 STATE THE ROOT CAUSE OF THE ISSUE

Failing to attend and make safe defects instructed by NYCC within 1 hour of the works instruction being received.

Section 5 WHAT ACTION IS PLANNEDTO ADDRESS THE ABOVE ROOT CAUSE?

- 5a CORRECTIVE ACTION (To address the issue)
 - Ensure works ordered are compliant with agreed definition of what constitutes a 1hr defect
 - Ensure sufficient resources are available to attend 1 hour call outs
 - Review operational process and educate resources on priority of works and attendance of works protocol
 - Record and report all issues that will impact on the attendance of a defect within an hour's response
- 5b PREVENTIVE ACTION (To prevent recurrence)
 - Interrogate trends of call outs and responses for lessons learned
- 5c RESPONSIBILITY CHART REQUIRED (PAGE 2)? Y

Note: When you have completed this section please send copy to originator.

Section 6 CONFIRM ACTION HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED (Supply supporting evidence)

5. Review of RM08 Target as part of Contract Performance Review completed. Using the new target, the performance indicator is currently exceeding the target

Action closed by:	Date:	



ACTION REPORT FORM	PROCESS OWNER: Group
	IMS Manager

Issue: 5A Date: August 2011

Page 2 of 2

Business Ref: Division and/or Location: Action Report No:

Date Pr	epared:	Responsibility of: P Jepps										
Improv	vement/Concern	Persons Involved										
Planne Task No	d Completion Date:	P Jepps	M Clayton	R Whitaker	Hub Schedulers	Mike Roberts (NYCC)	Andrew Binner (NYCC)	Contract Managers	Agents	lill .lenhson	By When	Complete
1	Task Description Ensure 1hr defect works orders are compliant with defect definition		N	4		X	ı		/	•	End of June * to be discussed with NYCC	
2	Ensure resources and productivity of resources are sufficient to address 1hr works orders		I					Х	I		Immediately	
3	Review RIS process to ensure compliance can be achieved		Χ		I			I	I		End of June 2015	
4	Feedback from call out's to be reviewed and reported within CPI's			I				I	X	I		
5	Target of 100% reduced as part of 2015/15 Performance Framework review	I					X					Υ
6												
Note	ONLY ONE PERSON CAN BE RESPONSI $(X = RESPONSIBLE, \ I = INVOICE)$			OR A	AN A	AC1	ΓΙVΙ	ΤΥ				

Distribute to:



Issue: 5A Date: August 2011

Page 1 of 2

Section 1

Business Ref: RIS HMC2012 Division and/or North Yorkshire Action Report No: RAP 15/16 PPI Location: SL02 Q2Rev

Section 2

Issued by: P Jepps	Issued to: North Yorkshire	Date: Oct 2015			
Contract Number: MU 5382	Works Order Number: N/A	Delivery Note Number: N/A			

Section 3 DESCRIPTION OF ISSUE

Not achieving the minimum target of CPI PPI SL02 during the contract year 2014/15 Measure – Achievement of Programme – Max number of days ahead/behind schedule Target – 8 days. Actual 10.29 days

Section 4 STATE THE ROOT CAUSE OF THE ISSUE

The schedule used in 14/15 produced by NYCC, contained a formulae that was not compliant with this specific PPI definition. Neither NYCC nor RIS were aware of this until RIS brought the 'flaw' to the attention of NYCC, but this was not until the end of the year when it was impossible to affect the end of year result.

Section 5 WHAT ACTION IS PLANNEDTO ADDRESS THE ABOVE ROOT CAUSE?

- 5a CORRECTIVE ACTION (To address the issue)
 - Maintenance schedule to have formulae amended
 - Performance to be checked and agreed monthly by RIS and NYCC
- 5b PREVENTIVE ACTION (To prevent recurrence)
 - RIS to manage internal and supply chain resources to ensure PPI compliance
- 5c RESPONSIBILITY CHART REQUIRED (PAGE 2)? Y

Note: When you have completed this section please send copy to originator.

Section 6 CONFIRM ACTION HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED (Supply supporting evidence)

Tasks 1, 2 and 3 of Action Plan all completed and current performance is at 0.31 against a target of 7.0. RAP to remain open until conclusion of 2015/16 year

Action closed by:	Date:



Issue: 5A

Date: August 2011

Page 2 of 2

Business Ref: RIS HMC2012 Division and/or Location: North Yorkshire Action Report No: 15/16 PPI SL02

Date Pr	repared: 11 June 2015	Re	sp	ons	ibili	ty o	of: P	Jep	ps		
Improv	vement/Concern		Р	ers		ı					
Diama	d Completion Date.	Colin O'Hara	Paul Gilmore (NYCC)	Richard Whitaker	lill Jephson					nen	lete
Task No	d Completion Date:	Solin	aul G	Richa	al. Ili					By When	Complete
1	Agree schedule for 2015/16 is correct	Х	_	ı	1					Immediately	Υ
2	Monthly performance to be agreed, signed off and submitted to JJ to report	Х		I	I					Immediately	Υ
3	Performance to be monitored and resources managed in line with PPI target	Х								Monthly	Υ
4											
5											
6											
Note	ONLY ONE PERSON CAN BE RESPONSI	BLE	FC	DR A	AN A	AC1	ΓΙVΙΤ	Υ	•		
	(X = RESPONSIBLE, I = INVO	LVE	D)								

Distribute to:

		Project	Target Date		ger	2	ב	April	2015/	March	2016	Bullet pointed actions to be implemented next
No No					J ana	Ref	ompletion Date	Progress			quarter to progress close out	
Ref	General Heading	Detail		Status	Lead Manager EFQM Ref No		Com	Qtr 1	Qtr 2	Qtr 3	Qtr 4	Completed Actions Actions within next quarter
1.0	Delivery of Programme											
1.01	Resources	Review and submit a Contract Succession Plan and review quarterly								Х		Review undertaken
1.02	Sustainability	Review and Publish Business Plan								Х		Draft document being prepared
1.03	Resources	Undertake review of operating structure in line with proposed minor works strategy									Х	To be reviewed following trial ending in Q4
1.04	Supply Chain	Undertake 'Supply Chain Day' focused on service deliver, customer focus and contract strategy.									х	To be held in Q4 in readiness for new financial year

of No		Project	Target Date	atus	Status Lead Manager		ompletion Date	April 2015/March 2016 Progress		rch	Bullet pointed actions to be implemented next quarter to progress close out	
Ref	General Heading	Detail		S			Com	Qtr 1	Qtr 2	Qtr 3	Qtr 4	Completed Actions Actions within next quarter
2.0	Customer Focus											
2.01	Partnership	Quarterly Reports to be jointly written and agreed	31/03/16		PJ/MR		Quarterly	Х	Х	Х	Х	Reports being submitted
2.02	Contract Communication	Quarterly Newsletter produced and distributed	31/03/16		RW		Quarterly					Newsletters being produced
2.03	Public Awareness	Equip selected personnel, together with TSCO's, personal CCTV camera's to safe guard sites where there is member of the public intervention	July 2015		MC		Sept 15		Х			Camera's and stop/go video facility now in place
2.04	Corporate Social Responsibility	Deliver a programme of 7 CSR Projects across the contract	31/03/16		RW		March 16				Х	

		Project	Target Date		ger	2	u	April	2015/I	March	2016	Bullet pointed actions to be implemented next
No No					Manager	l Ref	ompletion Date	Progress			quarter to progress close out	
Ref	General Heading	Detail		Status Lead N		EFQM Ref No	Com	Qtr 1	Qtr 2	Qtr 3	Qtr 4	Completed Actions Actions within next quarter
3.0	Value for Money											
3.01	Commercial	Close out 2013/14 Account	Dec 2015		JR					Х		Target to close out by end of October 2015
3.02	Contract Performance	Undertake a joint 'LEAN' Review to establish agreed processes for works ordering and delivery for new Option B process	Sept 15		PJ/MC						Х	Delay in trial will mean that the review will have to be delayed. Potential, dependent on outcome of trial, that this may get delayed to 2016/17
3.03	Value for Money	Undertake Market testing for Urban Grass cutting service	Aug 15		PJ				Х			Alternatives supplied to NYCC
3.04	Procurement	Establish fixed rates for salt deliveries with Cleveland Potash for 2016/17 &17/18	March 2016		PJ/MI						Х	Meeting planned with Cleveland Potash for Feb 2016



Issue: 5A Date: August 2011

Page 1 of 2

_		- 41			
8	Δ	~+	in	n	1

Business Ref:

RIS HMC2012

Division and/or Location:

North Yorkshire

Action Report No:

RAP 15/16 SPI PCS01 Q2Rev

_			

Issued by: P Jepps	Issued to:	Date: Oct 2015		
	North Yorkshire			
Contract Number: MU 5382	Works Order Number: N/A	Delivery Note Number: N/A		

Section 3 DESCRIPTION OF ISSUE

Not achieving the minimum target of CPI SPI PCS01 during the contract year 2014/15 Measure – Public Satisfaction - % satisfied or very satisfied Target 95%. Actual 94.82%

Section 4 STATE THE ROOT CAUSE OF THE ISSUE

Members of the public not replying to Customer Care cards

Section 5 WHAT ACTION IS PLANNEDTO ADDRESS THE ABOVE ROOT CAUSE?

5a CORRECTIVE ACTION (To address the issue)

The achievement of this SPI is determined by members of the public sending in their comments/experience

5b PREVENTIVE ACTION (To prevent recurrence) More cards to be posted to members of the public

- TSCO role now firmly embedded into the process
- 5c RESPONSIBILITY CHART REQUIRED (PAGE 2)? Y

Note: When you have completed this section please send copy to originator.

Section 6 CONFIRM ACTION HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED (Supply supporting evidence)

RAPto be monitored, currently continuing reporting 96.77% against a target of 93%

Action closed by: Date:



Business Ref: RIS HMC2012

ACTION REPORT FORM PROCESS OWNER: Group IMS Manager

Issue: 5A

Division and/or Location: North Yorkshire

Date: August 2011

Page 2 of 2

Action Report No:

RAP 15/16 SPI PCS01 Date Prepared: 11 June 2015 Responsibility of: P Jepps Improvement/Concern **Persons Involved** Operations Manager Schemes Agent Contract Manager Jill Jephson Complete By When **Planned Completion Date:** Task No **Task Description** 1 I 1 Χ ı On-going Deposit Customer Car cards with members of the public 2 On-going TSCO's role now firmly established 3 4 5 6

ONLY ONE PERSON CAN BE RESPONSIBLE FOR AN ACTIVITY

(X = RESPONSIBLE, I = INVOLVED)

Distribute to:

Note